Key Considerations for Addressing Campus Bias Incidents

Brittney L. Denley, Esq., Associate, Riley Safer Holmes & Cancila LLP
Sandra L. Musumeci, Esq., Partner, Riley Safer Holmes & Cancila LLP
Rachel Pereira, Esq., Ed.D., Senior Education Legal & Policy Advisor, Education Counsel, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP
Ryan P. Poscablo, Esq., Partner, Steptoe & Johnson LLP

Speakers

Brittney L. Denley
RSHC

Sandra L. Musumeci
RSHC

Rachel Pereira
Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough

Ryan P. Poscablo
Steptoe
Agenda

1. What is a “bias incident” vs. a “hate crime”?
2. Legal landscape
3. Federal involvement
4. Lessons from recent examples
5. Off-campus events
6. Best practices: Student Codes of Conduct
7. Bias Response Teams
What is a bias incident?

- Bias is defined as a preference formed, whether positive or negative, about individuals within a specific group of people, without reasonable justification that can prevent one’s judgment from being rational or objective.
- Bias incidents are defined as acts committed against a person or group that are motivated, in whole or in part, by prejudice against that person’s or group’s sex, gender identity, sexual orientation, national origin, race, religion, disability, veteran status, or other protected class.

What are hate crimes?

- Clery: criminal offenses that “manifest evidence that the victim was intentionally selected because of the perpetrator’s bias against the victim.”
- FBI: “a criminal offense against a person or property motivated in whole or in part by an offender’s bias against a race, religion, disability, ethnic origin or sexual orientation.”
- Clery: sufficient objective facts to lead a reasonable and prudent person to conclude bias motivation.
- And don’t forget timely notice…
Other Laws

• **Title VI:** prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, or national origin in all programs or activities receiving federal funding.

• **Title VII:** bars employers from discriminating against their employees on the basis of sex, race, color, national origin, and religion.

• **Title IX:** protects people from discrimination based on sex in education programs or activities that receive Federal financial assistance.

• **Rehabilitation Act:** prohibits employment discrimination against individuals with disabilities in the federal sector

• **Americans with Disabilities Act:** prohibits discrimination based on disability

---

Federal Hate Crimes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statute</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18 USC 241</td>
<td>Unlawful to conspire to injure, threaten or intimidate a person in their exercise of any right or privilege secured by the Constitution or the laws of the United States.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 USC 245</td>
<td>Crime to use force to interfere with any person because of their background in their enjoyment of a protected activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 USC 247</td>
<td>Prohibits the defacement, damage, or destruction of religious real property.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 USC 249</td>
<td>Crime to willfully cause bodily injury because of the victim’s actual or perceived race, color, religion or national origin.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
State Hate Crimes

- Forty-five states and the District of Columbia have statutes criminalizing bias-motivated violence or intimidation.
- There is no model hate crime statute.

Dear Educator:

Recipients of Federal financial assistance from the Department must take prompt and effective steps to address bullying and harassment of students based on actual or perceived race, color, or national origin that creates a hostile environment in school. The school's actions must be reasonably calculated to end the bullying or harassment, prevent its recurrence, and remedy its effects, as appropriate. The failure to do so would violate Title VI.

Schools also have an important role to play in encouraging a culture that empowers students to speak out when they witness bullying or harassment and to seek help if needed. As part of these efforts to foster safe and inclusive learning environments for all students, schools should ensure that students and their families, as appropriate, know how to report concerns and incidents of bullying and harassment on any basis.
EEOC Resolutions

- Establish guidelines that commit to selecting and evaluating speakers based on their contribution to academic discourse.
- Provide community with tools, opportunities, and platforms to encourage critical engagement with campus speakers.
- Reinforce a strong sense of academic identity among students.
Racist Language / Slurs in Academic Literature

- Consider whether the use of/reference to such language is legally actionable- Hate crime? Anti-Discrimination Policy violation?
- Does it add to/detract from the academic discourse? Are there administrative channels available to address this?

Racial Slurs / Graffiti / Social Media Posts

Racial Slurs, and the 15 Days That Shook Syracuse

How a protest by students of color at Syracuse University — #NotAgainSU — electrified the campus and gained national attention.

Inside a Battle Over Race, Class and Power at Smith College

A student said she was racially profiled while eating in a college dorm. An investigation found no evidence of bias. But the incident will not fade away.

UConn students’ arrest over racial slur prompts review of state’s ridicule ban

Two University of Connecticut students uttered a racial slur several times while walking through the parking lot of a campus apartment complex and were recorded by a black student.
Bias in the Community

Best Practices: Student Codes of Conduct

- Means of managing and mitigating risk.
- Process for developing policies – include stakeholders
- Simple, clear, concise language – avoid legalese as code must be understood by a diverse audience (beyond just students)
- Set forth consequences for violations, with proportionality
- Be mindful of applicable laws and regulations, and recent changes to laws
- Provide a mechanism for updates – consider contemporary issues
Best Practices: Bias Response Teams

• Bias response teams should include a variety of stakeholders with assigned roles.
• Bias Response Teams should be charged with working within the broader school policy framework, and should not set up a new disciplinary system.
• Bias Response Teams may work best when they review and triage incidents to appropriate structures and mechanisms within the college or university.

The First Amendment / Academic Freedom

• How do we square the importance of safety and the goals of Clery and other federal laws with the importance of protecting free speech on campuses?
• When considering an act’s classification as a hate crime how do we square the actor’s freedom of speech, even if offensive, with the harm associated with bias incidents?
NACUA materials, PowerPoint slides and recordings available as part of this program are offered as educational materials for higher education lawyers and administrators. They are prepared by presenters and are not reviewed for legal content by NACUA. They express the legal opinions and interpretations of the authors.

Answers to legal questions often depend on specific facts, and state and local laws, as well as institutional policies and practices. The materials, PowerPoint slides and comments of the presenters should not be used as legal advice. Legal questions should be directed to institutional legal counsel.

Those wishing to re-use the materials, PowerPoint slides or recordings should contact NACUA (nacua@nacua.org) prior to any re-use.